

**CHARLOTTE SELECTBOARD
MINUTES OF MEETING
TOWN HALL
MAY 16, 2013**

APPROVED

SELECTBOARD MEMBERS: Charles Russell, Chair; Ellie Russell, Heather Manning, John Owen, Winslow Ladue (via tele-communications).

OTHERS: Peter Trono, Peter Denton, Mary Mead, Robert Mack, and others.

CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Russell, Selectboard Chair, called the meeting to order at 4:30 p.m.

WARNING FOR A SPECIAL TOWN MEETING FOR THE PURPOSE OF VOTING ON PURCHASE OF AN AMBULANCE WITH FUNDING FROM THE FIRE AND RESCUE CAPITAL FUND – action item

MOTION by Ms. Russell, seconded by Mr. Owen, to warn a Special Town Meeting for Tuesday, June 25, 2013, at 7:00 p.m. at the Charlotte Central School for the purpose of voting on the purchase of an ambulance with funding from the Fire and Rescue Capital Fund.

DISCUSSION:

Ms. Russell read Article 1 of the warning.

VOTE: 5 ayes; motion carried.

REPLACEMENT OF 16 WINDOWS AT TOWN HALL AND TRIM & SIDING REPAIRS – action item

Select Contractor and bid proposal

Mr. Russell read an e-mail response from Dick St George, dated 05/15/2013, regarding five Selectboard questions related to Mr. St George's bid proposal.

Mr. Ladue noted that state contracts allowed for no more than an 8 percent markup for the purpose to acquire additional materials. It might be possible to use the Town dumpster, or to donate the used windows and sashes to ReStore North in Burlington, suggested Mr. Ladue.

Ms. Russell expressed concern regarding add-ons in the Spear and St George bid proposals. Mr. Owen noted that add-on in Mr. St George's bid for a 20 percent mark up was just for extra work beyond the scope of work.

Mr. Trono expressed concern regarding the three bid proposals, how to compare the bids, what Mr. St George meant in his responses to the Selectboard questions, and a 20 percent mark up. The Denton and Spear bids were more comparable and clearer. He was concerned that Mr. St George included the purchase of a dozen gloves, saw blades, drill bits, etc, on the Rice Lumber Town account on his invoices for work previously done on

the Town Hall. Where was the Town oversight on invoices, and should that be done by the Town Auditors, or Selectboard, asked Mr. Trono.

Ms. Mead asked for clarification regarding the time line for start and completion dates. She expressed concern that it took Dick St George an enormous amount of time to do just four window replacements, said Ms. Mead. Mr. Russell pointed out that Dick St George also did repairs to the north wall and interior of the building in addition to the windows.

Mr. Owen said he would like to talk to Dick St George before awarding a bid. He wanted to make sure of what occurred. It was an ethical issue, said Mr. Owen.

In response to questions, Mr. Bloch explained that the 16 replacement windows had been ordered and would arrive June 6th or 13th.

MOTION by Ms. Manning, seconded by Mr. Owen, to accept the bid proposal by Denton Construction, Inc, for the amount of \$23,240 to replace 16 windows and trim and make siding repairs at the Town Hall.

DISCUSSION:

Mr. Russell reviewed the three bid proposals and questioned if they could be compared as ‘apples to apples’ bids.

Mr. Ladue said that some of the material that appeared to be personal purchases by Mr. St George were for disposable items. However, you didn’t need 12 pairs of gloves unless there was a crew of 12 people, said Mr. Ladue.

Ms. Manning stated that a contractor needed to show up on time with their own tools and ready to go.

Ms. Mead said that Dick St George’s last job was more extensive than four windows, however, the Rice Lumber invoices totaled \$16,000. To give him the job with 16 windows was scary, said Ms. Mead.

Ms. Russell asked if exterior painting was included in the three bid proposals. Mr. Denton clarified that his bid included priming anything that was cut and put on the building. He understood that exterior painting of the building would be done by a painting contractor. He asked for a down payment with the rest due at the end of the job, said Mr. Denton.

Ms. Balaban said that Azec to be used would be low maintenance and wouldn’t rot. In terms of finish work, the previous contractor left screw holes that were unsightly. Would Mr. Denton fill in those holes, asked Ms. Balaban. Mr. Denton said he could take out the screws and put in a different screw with a plug.

Mr. Owen asked why Ms. Manning chose Denton Construction. Ms. Manning replied that she liked the Denton proposal that addressed the job specifications and

time frame, which would get the job done before the Town party. She appreciated his hourly rate, which was the lowest hourly rate quoted, said Ms. Manning.

There was discussion regarding the three bid proposals received, quoted hourly rates, and extra work anticipated. Mr. Trono pointed out that an hourly rate was a per person rate. A question was what was the overage for the last Town Hall project, and difference in labor costs, said Mr. Trono.

Ms. Manning noted that using Azec on the front of the building was an add-on in the Spear bid, note 4, and an add-on in the St George bid. It was hard to make an 'apples to apples' comparison for these bids. The Denton bid was clear and addressed what the Town asked for, reiterated Ms. Manning.

Ms. Balaban clarified that she was not maligning the work Dick St George did. He has a big advantage in bidding the job. He's been through the Town Hall building and knows how extensive the rot is and how much material he bought, said Ms. Balaban.

Mr. Russell suggested holding off awarding the contract until next week to gather more information for a better understanding of the proposals.

Ms. Manning stated she would not withdraw her motion.

VOTE: 1 aye (Ms. Manning), 4 nays; motion failed to carry.

Mr. Ladue suggested drafting a spread sheet with job specifications/requirements to give to the contractors to fill out for a better method of determining an 'apples to apples' comparison.

Mr. Trono suggested that the Selectboard reject all bids and schedule a pre-bid conference with the three contractors to clarify what the Town was looking for.

Mr. Russell, Ms. Manning and Dean Bloch would meet with the three contractors Tuesday, May 21, at 8:30 a.m. before the next Selectboard meeting on May 28th.

QUESTIONS/NEEDS:

- Ethics.
- 20 percent mark up by Dick St George.
- Extra material and an August time frame quoted by Dick St George.
- Denton to quote exterior painting.
- What are the expectations of priming, and exterior painting by other contractors.
- Prepare a spread sheet for the bid process by the Selectboard for a clearer understanding of the bid proposals.
- Add a bid discussion and decision for the May 28th Selectboard meeting.

Action to approve paying for the selected bid from the Repairs and Improvement Fund

No action taken.

ADJOURNMENT

MOTION by Ms. Manning, seconded by Mr. Owen, to adjourn the meeting.

VOTE: 5 ayes; motion carried.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:28 p.m.

Minutes respectfully submitted, Kathlyn Furr, Recording Secretary.