

## Pay Grid Questions

1. During the process of addressing pay issues and constructing a pay grid, the Town paid Gallagher & Flynn \$3400 for consulting services. What information was exchanged between the Town & our consultant during the process?
2. Throughout the process, it was stated several times and it is included in the Salary Administration Policy that the market for the Town of Charlotte is Vermont Towns with populations of 3,000 to 5,000. Is that actually reflected in the different position pay rate ranges for all employees or is it just for some employees?
3. It was noted in a "Market Assessment" by a board member in August of 2014 the following:
  - a. Clerk/Treasurer- our data is consistent with towns in the 3-5,000 range, although slightly lower than towns in Chittenden County. We appear to fall within the market range, but on the low side.
  - b. Assistant Clerk/Treasurer-Our job evaluation results are lower than that of the towns with 3-5,000 and even lower for Towns of Chittenden County. Either our job ranking is incorrect or the market is driving the salary for the position higher. We need to **adjust the pay grade up one or two levels for improved consistency in the market.**
  - c. Administrative Assistant – With a median of \$19.61 in towns with a population of 3-5,000 and \$18.74 in Chittenden County, our job evaluation median of \$15.82 is without question low. There are fewer Planning /Zoning assistant positions, but they too pay at a higher rate.

Between **August 2014** when the board wrote their "Market Assessment" and **January 2015** when the Pay Grid was finalized there were **no adjustments** to any of those 3 positions for the pay grade or that position's starting wage(see attached pay grids dated **9-11-14, 10-28-14, & 1/13/2015**). I have marked the 1-13-2015 2015 chart in red\* the median pay rates for Chittenden County; blue\* are the median pay rates for towns with a population of 3,000-5,000. If you select Step 7 (K) as where the median should fall(approximately) in a perfect mathematical world, it appears that the majority of town positions are more in line with Chittenden County data except for Town Clerk/Treasurer; Asst. Clerk/Treasurer; Admin. Asst. and Library Services Asst. For the majority of employees, the pay grid shows **the market is not Towns with a population of 3,000 to 5,000**; instead it is Chittenden County. This is not the market for employee pay rate determination as stated in the Salary Administration Policy.

4. If the Clerk/Treasurer; Assistant Clerk Treasurer & Administrative Assistant positions were treated the same as the other employees and Chittenden County median rates were the "market"-all three positions would still not even reach the median salary by the maximum 15 year mark. In fact, the Administrative Assistant position, at the current pay grade never reaches the median for 3,000 to 5,000 population Towns either. Raising the pay grade for both the Admin. Asst & Asst. Clerk/Treasurer would have allowed them to be placed on the grade at a lower step, with a higher starting pay rate ; therefore receiving the larger percentage increase as they moved up the steps as a new employee-also noted in the Salary Administration Policy under "Step Increases".

5. The pay grid on 9-11-2014 included 19 years of service, which would have allowed the board to include the Clerk/Treasurer position when placing all employees on the grid. The pay rate on that grid for 19 years was \$34.81. The adopted pay grid has a maximum of 15 years. The board determined through their evaluation process that the Clerk/Treasurer should be rated as having 22 years of experience but would be placed at the 15 year pay rate.
6. Every employee was placed on the grid according to their years of experience-prior and current and received the pay rate for that experience except for the Clerk/Treasurer. Several positions received substantial pay rate increases as a result of that placement. The Clerk/Treasurer was denied that same rating.
7. There are blatant inequities in the pay grid.

For the sake of comparison, I have listed the following chart showing pay rates 7/1/2013, 7/1/2014 & 6/30/2015 to illustrate how different positions were affected by the pay grid.

	<u>7/1/2013</u>	<u>7/1/2014</u>	<u>6/30/2015</u>	<u>% Inc.</u>
TOWN ADMIN	\$25.70(Selectboard Asst)	\$28.79(Town Admin)	\$29.70	15.6%
<b>CLERK/TREASURER</b>	<b>\$29.80</b>	<b>\$30.25</b>	<b>\$30.41</b>	<b>2%</b>
LIBRARY DIRECTOR	\$21.52	\$21.84	\$23.47	9.1%
YOUTH LIBRARIAN	\$14.88	\$15.10	\$16.67	12%
<b>ASST CLERK/TREAS</b>		<b>\$16.67(Booher)</b>	<b>\$16.68</b>	<b>0%</b>
TECH. LIBRARIAN	\$15.94	\$18.82	\$18.84	18.2%
<b>ADMIN. ASSISTANT</b>		<b>\$16.24</b>	<b>\$16.24</b>	<b>0%</b>
LIBRARY SAT. ASST.		\$11.87	\$15.34	29%
LIBRARY CATALOGUER		\$12.55	\$15.00	19.5%
LIBRARY CIRCULATION		\$12.41	\$12.74	2.7%
INTERLIBRARY LOAN		\$13.90	\$15.50	11.5%
LIBRARY SERV. ASST.		\$9.08	\$11.29	24.3%
CHIEF LISTER		\$14.34	\$18.80	31%

I would appreciate the Board taking some time to review the materials that I have provided for you. Please look at the information objectively and thoughtfully with an open mind. The Salary Administration Policy states that the goal is to provide a salary program that is fair, internally equitable and pays employees according to the value of their position and is competitive in the market. I request that this item be scheduled for discussion at a Selectboard meeting. Thank you-Mary

8/28/2014

### \$Market Assessment

VLCT data is from 2013. Our salaries are current rates being paid.

Towns in Chittenden County reflect the higher end of the range.

The market is considered to be Towns with a population of 3000-5000 and Towns in Chittenden County.

#### Town Administrator

Data is skimpy with only three towns reporting in towns with a population of 3000-4000 and only three towns in Chittenden County.

Fourteen towns reported in the VLCT survey of all towns

The results of our job evaluation seem to be consistent with the data for all towns, but lower than our market range towns with population of 3000-5000 and towns in Chittenden County.

#### Clerk/Treasurer

There is good data for this position.

Our data is consistent with the data from towns with a population of 3000 to 5000, although slightly lower than towns in Chittenden County. We appear to fall within the market range, but on the low side.

#### Assistant Clerk/Treasurer

There is good data for this position.

Our job evaluation results are consistent with the all towns VLCT data, but lower than that of the towns with a population of 3000-5000 and even lower for towns in Chittenden County. Either our job ranking is incorrect or the market is driving the salary for this position higher. We need to adjust the pay grade up by one or two levels for improved consistency with the market. Our incumbent is earning at the market rate.

#### Planner

There is no data for towns with a population of 3000-5000.

Our ranking puts us below the market data for Chittenden County. This is significant because our position includes the position of Zoning Administrator. We should review the ranking and if there is no change, consider adjusting to a higher pay grade based on market. Our incumbent, with less than one year of experience, is now paid at the mid-range value of our ranking.

#### Chief Librarian

There is good data for Chief Librarian (or Library Director)

We compete nicely with Chittenden County and run higher than towns with a population of 3000-5000. We appear to be reasonably within the market range.

#### Librarian

The VLCT data is difficult for librarian positions because they have only the categories of Chief Librarian, Library Assistant, Technical Librarian and Library Assistant. Shelburne has a Youth Librarian who differs from our Youth Librarian because the job does not include supervisory responsibilities. We can reasonably assume the Library Assistant jobs in all towns also do not include supervisory responsibilities as does our Library Assistant. Assuming that our Youth Librarian and other Librarian positions fall in the category of Assistant Librarian, it appears that our job evaluation dollars run lower than Chittenden County and higher than with towns of 3000-5000. We appear to be reasonably within the market range for all library positions, except for Technical Librarian. Although we are paying our

incumbent Technical Librarian within the market range, our job evaluation ranking puts this position below market range.

#### Recreation Director

There is no good data for Recreation Director. The two towns in Chittenden County pay \$19.43 (Hinesburg) and \$41.65 (Shelburne). The median for all towns in Vermont is \$23.25. We pay our incumbent with less than one year of experience at \$21.95. Our job evaluation ranking puts the median for this position at \$20.19 which is low.

#### Senior Center Director

There is also no good data for Senior Center Director. Four towns in Vermont have this position and one town in Chittenden County (Winooski). Winooski pays \$12.33. The median for all towns in Vermont (4) is \$19.86. The four towns are Bennington, Winooski, Springfield and Newport. Our job evaluation puts the median at \$17.44. Our incumbent with 10 years of experience earns \$19.51.

#### Administrative Assistant

The duties of an Administrative Assistant vary considerably, as do those of a Planning/Zoning Assistant. Thus although there is sufficient data, it is difficult to evaluate. Nevertheless, with a median of \$19.61 in towns with a population of 3000-5000 and \$18.74 in Chittenden County, our job evaluation median of \$15.82 for this position is without question low. We pay our incumbent with less than one year experience \$16.24. There are fewer Planning/Zoning Assistant positions, but they too pay at a higher rate. The median for towns of 3000-5000 population is \$15.68 and in Chittenden County it is \$19.15. Frank's data shows a median of \$18.00 for a mostly comparable administrative assistant position, although perhaps a little less demanding.

#### Chief Lister

There is good data for Chief Lister. Towns of 3000-5000 size have a median of \$16.71. Chittenden County pays a median of \$15.29. Our ranking for this position is considerably higher at \$19.22. However the job requirements may vary significantly in our town vs. other towns.

#### Lister

There is good data for Lister and our rankings seem to fit well in the market range for this position.

Overall, although our job evaluation indicate a good internal relationship between positions, it appears that we are more often than not low in what we would pay as compared to our market area, assuming are market area to be towns of comparable size and particularly towns in Chittenden County.

Chittenden County Towns  
and Frank's data  
2014-2015

	Town Admin	Clerk-Treas	Asst CT	Planner	Zoning Admin	Chief Librarian	Asst Lib	Tech Lib	Library Aide	Rec Director	Sr. Cr. Director	Admin. Asst	P/Z Asst	Chief Librar	Lister	Population
TOWN																
Ferrisburg			19.43		22.00											2,757
Colchester		35.53	25.45		28.08	30.56	27.89	25.46	19.37	21.77			17.43		8.73	17,245
Essex Junction		35.54		25.56	25.93	25.36			12.06	21.12		23.85	18.27			9,498
Hinesburg	32.69	29.52	21.12		24.04	27.30	21.10					19.03	23.85			4,457
Huntington												15.61				1,969
Jericho Village		18.00	19.00													1,329
Richmond				21.76	20.69	26.25	16.07	17.00	12.61			20.00	18.76			4,093
Shelburne		31.58	20.95		23.51	24.51	20.07	16.14	13.56			17.93				7,449
So. Burlington		37.23	20.45	28.17	34.27	32.84	21.52	18.90	13.40	20.70		19.82	16.48			18,400
Underhill	20.81	28.76		20.82	20.82									21.98	16.61	3,044
Westford				20.00	18.32	18.54			11.50						13.88	2,043
Williston		27.47	17.52	25.13		30.85	28.08	23.16	18.27			19.71	19.53	17.30	14.63	8,962
Average	26.75	30.45	19.81	23.57	23.94	27.03	22.46	20.13	14.40	21.20	no data	19.42	19.05	19.64	13.46	
Median	26.75	30.55	20.70	23.45	23.78	26.78	21.31	18.90	13.40	21.12	no data	19.71	18.52	19.64	14.26	
Median (3-5000)	23.87	24.82	19.30	21.40	20.82	20.75	15.50	13.94	11.65	21.72	10.25	20.25	15.63	17.72	13.77	
Towns																
Charlotte	28.79	30.25	17.75	23.35		21.85	15.10	18.82	11.87	21.95	19.51	16.24		14.34	14.34	3,812
current(2014)																
All VLCT Towns																
Median	24.04	22.20	15.61	22.10	19.48	17.48	14.25	18.90	11.88	22.10	21.21	17.00	15.89	14.48	13.00	
											3 towns					
Our Survey																
Average	29.42	22.76	18.37	25.56	19.70	no data	no data	no data	no data	inadequate	no data	17.16	no data	no data	18.91	
Median	30.94	23.16	18.19	inadequate	19.86	no data	no data	no data	no data	no data	no data	16.94	no data	no data	19.36	
Frank's data				data (2 no's)												
Median			22.23	accountant								\$18.00	level 2			
10/8/2014												22.08	level 3			